Suggestions for Providing Evidence of Teaching¹

This document is designed to help you identify and record the various elements of your teaching and learning practice. You will find it helpful for selecting items to include in documents that describe your teaching practice and its impact, such as those required for academic hiring processes, promotion and tenure, and teaching award nominations. Adapted from Kenny et al. (2018) and including "Possible Items for a Teaching Dossier" from section 3.2 of the CAUT Teaching Dossier (2018) guide², this document lists teaching activities and ways in which you can document them and provide evidence of their effectiveness. There is some overlap in the facets of teaching activity and categories of evidence and not all activities will apply to your teaching practice. Choose the most relevant activities and supporting evidence given your particular context.

Questions about collecting evidence of teaching effectiveness or developing a teaching philosophy statement? Contact CITL at <u>educatordev@mun.ca</u> or (709) 864-3028 to consult with our staff.

Facets of Teaching Expertise and Examples of Supporting Evidence

Teaching and Supporting Learning

Teaching that places learning at its centre involves creating experiences and environments that empower students to engage, learn deeply, and become self-directed learners (Trigwell, Prosser & Waterhouse, 1999; Weimer, 2013). Teaching organized around student learning also recognizes that understanding and improving learning is an ongoing process, hence, teaching expertise is developed over time and always evolving (Hendry & Dean, 2002; Kreber, 2002). A commitment to setting clear expectations for both teaching and learning, regularly providing and gathering feedback, and critically reflecting on one's teaching practice and philosophy guides practitioners in a learning-focused teaching framework (Lizzio, Wilson & Simons, 2002; Nichol & Macfarlene-Dick, 2006; Tigelaar et. al, 2002).

Example Activities	Examples of Evidence
 Develops a teaching philosophy 	Evidence from Self:
 Reflects on the teaching and learning approaches 	 Teaching philosophy statement—one to two pages describing what you believe about
that are typically used in one's discipline	teaching and student learning, why you hold these beliefs, and brief highlights of how you
- Explores the process of placing student learning at	put them into practice
the centre of one's teaching activities	- List of teaching roles and responsibilities (list of course titles and numbers, unit values or
 Recognizes that there are multiple ways to design 	credits, enrolments with brief elaboration (1))
learning experiences and engage with students	 List of course materials prepared for students (2)
 Recognizes that teaching expertise is 	- Selected course materials such as: a description of an innovative teaching activity or
developmental in nature	approach (e.g., inquiry-based, experiential learning); an informal survey designed to collect

¹ Adapted from: Kenny, N., Berenson, C. Radford, S., Nikolaou, N., Benoit, W., Mueller, R., Paul, R. & Perrault, E. (2018). *A Guide to Providing Evidence of Teaching*. Calgary, AB: University of Calgary.

² With permission from CAUT, items are identified in example activities and evidence by the corresponding item number in brackets.

 Reads about teaching and learning approaches 	feedback on a novel teaching activity; a lesson plan for an interactive class; an excerpt from
and activities	a course outline; an assignment description; a grading rubric; a learning resource or materials
 Tries new teaching and learning approaches and 	 Information on one's availability to students and evidence of prompt and effective
activities	correspondence via e-mail (3)
 Intentionally aligns course components (i.e., 	- Report on identification of student difficulties and encouragement of student participation
learning goals, learning activities, assessment	in courses or programs (4)
strategies)	 Statement about quizzes and examination items being keyed to instructional objectives (6)
 Develops educational experiences with a range of 	- Reflections on one's teaching, including evidence collected from students and colleagues—
learners in mind	how these strategies and supporting material link back to your teaching philosophy, what
 Designs participatory learning activities 	they say about your strengths and accomplishments, what you've learned and how you will
 Encourages students to apply their learning in 	continue to grow and improve
novel contexts	 Invitations to teach from outside agencies (37)
 Designs assessment strategies that provide clear 	 Short and long-term teaching goals
criteria and timely feedback	
 Establishes appropriate course workload 	Evidence from Students:
requirements to challenge students while	- Student scores on teacher-made or standardized tests, possibly before and after a course
ensuring adequate time and support	has been taken as evidence of learning (7)
 Collects feedback at various times from a variety 	 Intentional formative/midterm feedback collected from students
of sources	 Formal faculty feedback/evaluation form data (e.g., student comments)
 Uses student feedback to adjust teaching practices 	- Written comments received during the term or after a course has been completed (26)
 Shares teaching philosophy with colleagues and 	– Samples of student work (e.g., exemplars, successive drafts, student laboratory workbooks
students	and other kinds of workbooks or logs (8), student essays, creative work, projects, and field-
 Begins to gather evidence for a dossier that 	work reports (9))
documents one's effectiveness and growth	- Student achievements directly related to one's teaching and learning activities (i.e., career
 Takes steps to emphasize the interrelatedness 	placement, grad school admission, publications, presentations)
and relevance of different kinds of learning (5)	- Record of students who select and succeed in advanced courses of study in the field (10)
 Creates opportunities for students to become 	 Record of students who elect to take another course with you (11)
aware of the conditions that best support their	 Honours received such as being nominated or named "teacher of the year" (32)
learning	- Teaching awards received from student bodies (e.g., MUNSU Award for Excellence in
 Engages students as collaborators or partners in 	Teaching and Outstanding Contribution to Student Life)
the classroom (e.g., includes students in course	- Selective and purposeful informal feedback from learners that speak directly to specific
and assignment design)	teaching practices and/or impact
 Contributes to course development and 	- Letters of support from former students (no longer teaching or in a supervisory relationship)
improvement (29)	– Reports from employers of students (e.g., in a work-study or cooperative program) (36)
 Prepares a textbook or other instructional 	
materials such as on-line 'courseware' (24)	Evidence from Colleagues/Peers:
 Formally and informally shares course materials 	
	 Teaching observation documents (e.g., teaching squares)

 Situates one's courses within broader curriculum 	 Letters of support from colleagues
planning processes	 Statements from colleagues who have observed teaching either as members of a teaching
	team or as independent observers of a particular course, or who teach other sections of the same course (27)
	 Selective and purposeful informal feedback from colleagues that speak directly to specific teaching practices and/or impact
	 Written comments from those who teach courses for which a particular course one teaches is a prerequisite (28)
	 Statement about teaching achievements from administrators at one's own institution or another institution (33)
	 Teaching awards (title, description, nomination process, and criteria of award) Invitations to teach
	 Peer-reviewed publications related to teaching and learning
	 Peer feedback from clinical practicum and/or preceptorship feedback
	 Cooperative work placement supervisor feedback regarding student learning and development
	 Invitations based on one's reputation as a teacher, such as media interviews on successful teaching innovation (39)

Supervision and Mentorship

Supervision or mentorship is characterized as a positive, respectful, mutually-beneficial relationship that supports the teaching and academic development of both mentor and mentee (Mathias, 2005). Mentoring relationships foster self-exploration, career advancement, intellectual development, enhanced confidence and competence, social and emotional support, academic citizenship and socialization, information sharing, and professional identity formation (Johnson, 2007; Schlosser et al., 2011; Foote and Solem, 2009). Mentorship typically occurs between an experienced faculty member and a less experienced colleague, student or postdoctoral scholar, but can also occur in a group context (Phillips, Dennison, Cox, 2015). Developed formally (i.e., structured programs) or informally, mentorship focuses on topics most relevant to the mentor and mentee. Supervisors are mentors and more. "Supervisor" means a qualified individual, who is normally an Academic Staff Member, who serves as the primary mentor to a Graduate Student, oversees the Graduate Student's academic progress, and serves as chair of the Graduate Student's supervisory committee, where applicable. Supervision is a professional relationship which includes an aspect of accountability for both supervisor and supervisee. Supervisors not only provide academic supervision (research and writing), they are also expected to mentor students in career development (securing funding, dissemination, professional and collaborative skills) (CAGS, 2008).

Example Activities	Examples of Evidence
 Recognizes value of mentorship as a relational 	Evidence from Self:
and reciprocal process	 Supervision and mentorship philosophy statement, including connections with teaching
 Identifies areas where mentorship is needed for 	philosophy
one's own growth and development	- List of undergraduate and graduate students and post-doctoral scholars formally supervised
 Explores mentoring opportunities and resources 	or mentored and a description of roles/responsibilities
 Seeks mentorship in a variety of contexts 	 Self-developed mentorship/supervision structures, frameworks, or processes

 List of undergraduate and graduate students and post-doctoral scholars informally supervised or mentored and a description of roles/responsibilities supervision and mentoring outside of a course (e.g., student seeking advice, job searches, graduate applications, community activities, student club activities, reference letters) Description of mentorship provided for peers (e.g., discussing teaching approaches, reviewing and sharing course outlines and course materials) Description of mentorship sought out and obtained from peers (e.g., asking for advice on evaluation methods, course content, approaches) Presentations and publications on supervision or mentoring Support to students for presentations and publications (scholarship) Written agreements made with students to support mentorship and supervision activities (e.g., monthly meetings, regular feedback, setting timelines) Reflections on your mentorship and supervision and other evidence (i.e., evidence from students and colleagues)—how these strategies and supporting material link back to your supervision philosophy, what they say about your strengths and accomplishments, what you've learned and how you will continue to grow and improve Evidence from Students: Graduate feedback (34) Comments made about supervision/mentoring activities on formal evaluations (if applicable) Selective and purposeful informal feedback from learners that speak directly to specific supervision and mentorship practices and/or impact Letters of support from former students (no longer teaching or in a supervisor) relationship) Information about student activities and achievements related to one's supervision and mentoring (e.g., job placement, graduate school admission, presentations made) Evidence from Colleagues/Peers: <
been prepared for graduate studies (30)Letters of support from colleagues

Professional Learning and Development

Professional learning and development of practice is a key component of expert practice and contributes to teacher reflective practice. Reflective practice and participation in formal and informal professional development is linked to improved student learning outcomes and engagement as well as improved experiences for teachers (Carmichael, 2012). Professional development includes engaging in formal processes such as conferences, seminars, workshops, courses, or programs on teaching and learning, and collaborative learning among members of a community. Professional learning can also occur in informal contexts such as discussions among work colleagues, independent reading and research, observations of a colleague's work, or other learning from a peer (Arthur, 2016).

Example Activities	Examples of Evidence
 Identifies potential professional learning 	Evidence from Self:
opportunities	- Documentation of participation in seminars, workshops, and professional meetings
 Becomes involved in an association or society 	intended to improve teaching (21)
concerned with the improvement of teaching (20)	- Products or documents related to professional learning activities (e.g., outcomes from a
 Identifies learning interests/topics/themes 	community of practice)
 Recognizes that professional learning and 	 Record of the changes resulting from self-evaluation (15)
development is ongoing throughout one's career	 Description of instructional innovations attempted and evaluation of their effectiveness (16)
 Uses general support services such as the 	- Details of courses, workshops, and activities designed and delivered to peers (e.g., number
teaching and learning centre in improving one's	of attendees, level of involvement, goal, whether it was departmental, faculty, university-
teaching (22)	wide, regional, national or international)
 Engages in professional learning opportunities 	 Reflection on why you engaged in professional learning—what you learned and how you
(e.g., conferences, workshops, communities of	incorporated this into your teaching practice, how these learnings have influenced your
practice, teaching/facilitation square,	beliefs about teaching and learning
facilitation/coaching development opportunities)	 Reflection aligning professional development activities with evidence from students
 Reads journals on improving teaching and 	- Semester/annual reflective memo—reflection on learning, strengths, and areas for growth
attempts to implement acquired ideas (17)	 Professional development goals (short and long-term)
 Reviews new teaching materials for possible 	
application including exchanges course materials	Evidence from Students:
with a colleague from another institution (18)	 Student comments that relate to practices that you implemented from professional
 Critically reflects on and documents professional 	learning activities
learning and development (e.g., in discussions	
with colleagues, to self-assess, to incorporate into	Evidence from Colleagues/Peers:
practice, to include in annual reviews, tenure and	 Peer comments that relate to practices that you implemented from professional learning
promotion processes, awards, teaching dossiers)	activities
 Applies learning to practice and critically reflects 	 Letters of support from colleagues (e.g., reflections on what they have learned from you)
on that experience	 Documents and feedback from peer teaching observations or teaching squares (27)
 Discusses learning with others 	
 Designs, develops, and implements professional 	
learning opportunities for colleagues	

 Contributes to professional learning of others (e.g., offers workshops, forums, facilitates communities of practice) Contributes to and advances the knowledge and practice of professional learning to the broader educational community 	
educational community	

Educational Leadership

Educational leaders influence change and implement initiatives to strengthen teaching and learning practices, communities, and cultures (Keppell, O'Wyer, Lyon & Childs, 2010; Mårtensson & Roxa, 2016). They share their expertise to inspire and help others strengthen their teaching practices; implement strategic programs, initiatives and policies to improve teaching and student learning; advocate for positive change; and lead institutions, faculties, and committees to continuously improve postsecondary education (Creanor, 2014; Mårtensson & Roxa, 2016; Taylor, 2005). Educational leadership is demonstrated through formal leadership roles (e.g., committee chairs, department heads), structures and responsibilities, and through leadership activities that may not be formally identified as part of one's teaching responsibilities (Creanor, 2014; Jones, Lefoe, Harvey & Ryland, 2012; Mårtensson & Roxa, 2016).

 Leads development and implementation of teaching and learning initiatives at a variety of levels (e.g., departmental, faculty, university, national, international) Creates and leads initiatives to help colleagues strengthen their teaching practices Creates and leads opportunities for colleagues to network and share experiences, and for communities of practice to develop (e.g., journal clubs, online collaborations, in-person networks) Holds formal leadership roles that advance teaching and learning (e.g., committees, curricular reviews, working groups) Facilitates planning related to teaching and learning Formally and informally shares course materials and teaching approaches with colleagues Situates their courses within broader curriculum planning processes 	 Description of accepted invitations to consult on, review, or contribute to the development of internal or external academic programs Invitations to contribute to the teaching literature (38) Description of accepted invitations to act as a visiting teaching and learning scholar at another institution Reflection on how your educational leadership contributions relate to your teaching philosophy, your strengths, what you have learned, and how you hope to further grow and develop Evaluation data (e.g., student engagement data, retention or admission rates) that relate to one's educational leadership contributions Letters of support from former students that speak to one's educational leadership activities (no longer teaching or in a supervisory relationship) Selective and purposeful informal feedback from learners that speak directly to specific educational leadership practices and/or impact Evidence from Colleagues/Peers: Teaching and learning workshop participant evaluation data, including qualitative comments Example assessment reports from external accreditation or program review committees Requests for advice or acknowledgement of advice received by a committee on teaching or similar body (31) Letters of support from colleagues, senior administrators, or collaborators that speak to one's educational leadership contributions and impact
- Situates their courses within broader curriculum	 Teaching and learning workshop participant evaluation data, including qualitative comments Example assessment reports from external accreditation or program review committees
	- Letters of support from colleagues, senior administrators, or collaborators that speak to

Research, Scholarship, and Inquiry

One way in which teaching expertise is both developed and expressed is through research, scholarship, and inquiry—terms that reflect the variations of this activity across different contexts (Poole, 2013). Teaching and learning have a complex relationship that invites teachers to develop "pedagogical content knowledge" (Shulman, 1986), or an understanding of how learning happens (or doesn't) within specific disciplines and subject areas. Research, scholarship, and inquiry play a key role in developing this knowledge. Expert teachers consult relevant existing research to build a strong foundation for designing, implementing, and assessing effective learning experiences for students (Shulman, 2004). Expert teachers may also conduct and share their own pedagogical research, scholarship, or inquiry not only to advance their own understanding, but also to contribute to the larger body of knowledge about effective teaching and learning (Felten 2013; Shulman, 1993).

Example Activities	Examples of Evidence
 Identifies curiosities about teaching and student 	Evidence from Self:
learning	- Self-reflective comments or artifacts that connect choices within one's teaching practice to
 Becomes aware of teaching and learning research 	findings in discipline based education research and/or scholarship in teaching and learning
and discipline-based educational research	literature
literature	 Documentation of course materials that reflect teaching and learning research
 Identifies people to have conversations with 	- Description of teaching and learning research projects and/or teaching and learning grants
about teaching and learning scholarship and	received and connecting these to teaching and learning literature and one's professional
research	development
 Reads and reflects on the literature on teaching 	 Listing involvement (participation, presentation) in non-peer reviewed events where togething and logging recognish ideas are discussed with colleagues.
 and learning Applies scholarship in teaching and learning and 	teaching and learning research ideas are discussed with colleagues Editor or peer reviewer for teaching and learning or scholarship of teaching and learning
discipline-based educational research to improve	publication
one's teaching practice and students' learning	 Editor or contributor to a professional journal on teaching one's subject (25)
 Prepares a textbook or other instructional 	 List and description of teaching and learning grants received
materials such as on-line 'courseware' (24)	 List and description collaborative partnerships and research projects initiated
- Asks questions about one's students' learning and	 Future goals related to teaching and learning research, scholarship, and inquiry
its relationship to teaching	- Reflections on your teaching and learning research, and other evidence (i.e., evidence from
 Conducts research on one's own teaching or 	students and colleagues)—how these strategies and supporting material link back to your
course (19)	teaching philosophy, what they say about your strengths and accomplishments, what
 Collects evidence of students' learning 	you've learned, and how you will continue to grow and improve
 Participates in local conferences and events to 	
share knowledge related to teaching and learning	Evidence from Students:
 Engages in research, scholarship, and inquiry with 	 Summary of quantitative and/or quantitate data collected as part of a systematic inquiry to inform one's teaching
 peers Assesses the efficacy of high-impact teaching and 	 Themes in student data and feedback that characterize students' learning experiences
learning practices	 Description and documentation of ethical research/scholarly/inquiry strategies for
 Develops approaches to teaching that are 	providing a variety of student feedback and data on their learning (e.g., focus groups,
informed by research, critical reflection (e.g.,	surveys, setting up students as representatives to provide a formal lens to provide
examining one's own context and assumptions),	feedback)
and discussions with peers	- Selective and purposeful informal feedback from students who have been involved in
 Contributes to the knowledge and practices of the 	scholarly teaching projects (e.g., peer mentors, TAs or research assistants hired to work on
broader academic community (e.g., conference	development projects)
presentations, publications) to expand and	 Letters of support from former students (no longer teaching or in a supervisory
advance the practice and scholarship of teaching	relationship) commenting on how their involvement in scholarly teaching project
and learning	experiences has affected their learning and growth

Evidence from Colleagues/Peers:
 Invitation to speak on teaching and learning research topic Peer-reviewed publications and presentations related to inquiry and scholarship in teaching and learning Evidence of impact on peers' scholarship (citations, others' application of one's scholarship in teaching and learning and/or discipline-based educational research contributions) Selective and purposeful informal feedback from peers that speak to one's contributions related to inquiry, research, and scholarship in teaching and learning Letters from colleagues/peers that speak to one's contributions related to inquiry, research, and scholarship in teaching and learning

References:

- Arthur, L. (2016). Communities of practice in higher education: professional learning in an academic career. *International Journal for Academic Development*, 21(3): 230-241.
- Canadian Association of Graduate Studies (CAGS) (2008). Guiding principles for graduate student supervision. Retrieved from: <u>https://cags.ca/documents/publications/working/Guiding%20Principles%20for%20Graduate%20Student%20Supervision%20in%20Canada%20-%20rvsn7.pdf</u>
- Canadian Association of University Teachers (CAUT) (2018). CAUT Teaching Dossier. Retrieved from https://www.caut.ca/sites/default/files/caut-teaching-dossier. CAUT Teaching Dossier. Retrieved from https://www.caut.ca/sites/default/files/caut-teaching-dossier-2018-11. CAUT Teaching Dossier.
- Carmichael, D. L., and Martens, R. P. (2012). Midwestern magic: Iowa's statewide initiative engages teachers, encourages leadership, and energizes student learning. *Journal of Staff Development 33*(3). 22-26.
- Creanor, L. (2014). Raising the profile: An institutional case study of embedding scholarship and innovation through distributive leadership. *Innovations in Education and Teaching International*, *51*(6), 573-583.
- Felten, P. (2013). Principles of good practice in SoTL. Teaching & Learning Inquiry, 1(1), 121-125.
- Foote, K. E. & Solem, M. N. (2009). Toward better mentoring for early career faculty: Results of a study of US geographers. *International Journal for Academic Development*, *14*(1), 47-58.
- Hendry, G. D. & Dean, S. J. (2002). Accountability, evaluation and teaching expertise in higher education. *International Journal of Academic Development*, 7(1), 75-82.
- Johnson, B. (2007). Transformational supervision: When supervisors mentor. Professional Psychology: Research and Practice, 38(3), 259-267.
- Jones, S., Lefoe, G., Harvey, M., & Ryland, K. (2012). Distributed leadership: A collaborative framework for academics, executives and professionals in higher education. *Journal of Higher Education Policy and Management*, *34*(1), 67-78.
- Kenny, N., Berenson, C., Chick, N., Johnson, C., Keegan, D., Read, E., & Reid, L. (2017, October). A developmental framework for teaching expertise in postsecondary education. Poster presented at the International Society for the Scholarship of Teaching and Learning Conference, Calgary, Alberta, Canada. Retrieved from: <u>http://connections.ucalgaryblogs.ca/2017/11/04/developing-a-learning-culture-a-framework-for-the-growth-of-teachingexpertise/</u>

- Keppell, M., O'Dwyer, C., Lyon, B., & Childs, M. (2011). Transforming distance education curricula through distributive leadership. *Journal of Asynchronous Learning Networks*, *15*(4), 9-21.
- Kreber, C. (2002). Teaching excellence, teaching expertise, and the scholarship of teaching. Innovative Higher Education, 27(1), 5-23.
- Lizzio, A., Wilson, K., & Simons, R. (2002). University students' perceptions of the learning environment and academic outcomes: Implications for theory and practice. *Studies in Higher Education*, 27(1), 27-52.
- Nicol, D. J., & Macfarlane-Dick, D. (2006). Formative assessment and self-regulated learning: A model and seven principles of good feedback practice. *Studies in Higher Education*, *31*(2), 199-218.
- Mathias, H. (2005) Mentoring on a programme for new university teachers: a partnership in revitalizing and empowering collegiality. *International Journal for Academic Development*, *10*(2), 95-106.
- Mårtensson, K., & Roxå, T. (2016). Leadership at a local level–Enhancing educational development. *Educational Management Administration & Leadership*, 44(2), 247-262.
- Phillips, S. L., Dennison, S. T., Cox, M. (2015). *Faculty mentoring: A practical manual for mentors, mentees, administrators, and faculty developers.* Herndon, US: Stylus Publishing. Retrieved from <u>http://www.ebrary.com</u>
- Poole, G. (2013). Square one: What is research? In K. McKinney (Ed.), *The scholarship of teaching and learning in and across the disciplines* (135-151). Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press.
- Shulman, L. S. (2004). Lamarck's revenge: Teaching among the scholarships. *Teaching as Community Property: Essays on Higher Education* (164-172). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Shulman, L. S. (1993). Teaching as community property: putting an end to pedagogical solitude. *Change*, 25(6), 6-7.
- Schlosser, L. Z., Lyons, H. Z., Talleyrand, R. M., Kim, B. S. K., & Johnson, W. B. (2011). Advisor-advisee relationships in graduate training programs. *Journal of Career Development*, 38(1), 3-18.
- Taylor, K. L. (2005). Academic development as institutional leadership: An interplay of person, role, strategy, and institution. *International Journal for Academic Development*, *10*(1), 31-46.
- Tigelaar, D. E. H., Dolmans, D. H. J. M., Wolfhagen, I. H. A. P., and Van Der Vleuten, C. P. M. (2004). The development and validation of a framework for teaching competencies in higher education. *Higher Education*, *48*, 253-268.
- Trigwell, K., Prosser, M., & Waterhouse, F. (1999). Relations between teachers' approaches to teaching and students' approaches to learning. *Higher Education*, *37*(1), 57-70.

Weimer, M. (2013) Learner-centred teaching: Five key changes to practice (2nd ed.). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.



This guide is distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution Non-Commercial License 4.0 (https://creativecommons. org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/), which permits sharing and adapting of the material, provided that the original work is properly attributed.